



## HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road  
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs  
**Associate Commissioners:** Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

### ~~ MINUTES ~~

**Thursday, October 17, 2013 – OLD BUSINESS**

4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:05 p.m. by Ms Hill-Holdgate

Staff in attendance: M. Voigt, HDC Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp

Absent Members: Leonardo-Finger

Late Arrivals: Williams 1:06 p.m., Coombs 1:26 p.m.

Early Departures: Coombs 2:11 p.m.; Hill-Holdgate 2:47 p.m.; Barham 3:00 p.m.; McLaughlin 3:00 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

#### I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

#### II. CONSENT

1. Hopper, C&D	4 Newtown Road	Minor window to door/deck	55-302	Jack Bulger
Sitting	Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (Barham)</b>			
Vote	Carried 3-0/McLaughlin abstain		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60434</b>

#### III. OLD BUSINESS

1. Fraker	12 Mount. Vernon Street – HSAB	Revisions	55.4.1-35	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	<b>Mark Poor</b> , Permits Plus – Reviewed the project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(1:09) <b>HSAB</b> – Incomplete application, recommend view, need photos, house loses historic appearance. <b>Barham</b> – North elevation, the existing house has a lean-to profile that is obliterated; the dormer looks oversized and is not appropriate on the building; would like to see some remnant of the existing lean-to preserved. East elevation gable window 12-over-12 is large; should be reduced to fit better with the 6-over-6s below. <b>McLaughlin</b> – No comment. <b>Camp</b> – Nothing to add. <b>Williams</b> – East elevation is not visible; if that window could be smaller, that would be fine.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)</b>			
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>	

2.	Summer St. Church	1 Summer Street – HSAB	Copper gutters	42.3.3-70	N. McMullen
Sitting	Hill-Holdgate (acting), McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Barham				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Nathan McMullen</b> – On the east elevation will repair the existing gutter. Today asking that on the west elevation to change the 4X5 gutter to a 4X6 gutter that will marry the corner better and have more capacity. <b>Jason Zinser</b> – The west elevation gutter will be wood with the modern 4X6 gutter profile and downspouts to be boxed in wood.				
Public	<b>David Barham</b> , 6 Pine Street – Suggested matching the historic profile in copper; asked if that had been considered. As the gutters come together at the front, the proposed gutter will not match with the existing. On a very important historic structure in Town, it is important to hang onto the details; though there is an immediate maintenance problem that needs to be addressed. Thinks the commission should permit a temporary approval while the church seeks a more permanent and appropriate solution.				
Concerns	(1:18) <b>Camp</b> – No concerns. <b>McLaughlin</b> – Agrees with Mr. Barham’s comments.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve the wood gutters and downspouts and entertain into the motion part of Mr. Barham’s suggestion that the church goes back to the original profile when financially feasible. (McLaughlin)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60435</b>	
3.	Ribik, Joan	12 Chuck Hollow Road	Porch, door	72-79	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Val Oliver</b> – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:27) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from September 24. <b>McLaughlin</b> – The changes are in keeping with the house. <b>Coombs</b> – No concerns.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)</b>				
Vote	Carried 2-1/Williams opposed		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60436</b>	
4.	Hall, Timothy	135 Orange Street	Dismantle/demo	55-85	T. Hall
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Tim Hall</b> , owner – Asserted that 80% of the building is riddled with Power Post beetles. Plan to dismantle to salvage what is possible for reuse. This was the original house; received approvals to demolish the other structures on the lot. <b>Ted Burnham</b> , engineer – Reviewed the findings detailed in his report that were submitted to the file. More than 50% of the structure has been marginalized.				
Public	<b>David Barham</b> , 6 Pine Street – His understanding of what Town Counsel told HDC is that the board cannot prevent the demolition of a structure based upon its materials. Therefore, what is before the board is not the materials but whether or not the board is willing to permit the removal of the appearance of the building. If the board is willing to permit its demolition, a drawn record of the building should be maintained of the contributing structure.				
Concerns	(1:33) <b>McLaughlin</b> – It isn’t a good idea to put new fabric against old. This building has gone past its time and should be demolished. <b>Coombs</b> – Agree with Mr. McLaughlin. <b>Williams</b> – Need to make a finding that the structure is so compromised that the structure can be removed per the photographic evidence. What is necessary for the file is photographic documentation of the existing structure.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve the demolition with the finding that the structure is not longer structurally sound based upon the report submitted by the engineer and photographic documentation of the existing structure for the permanent record. (McLaughlin)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60437</b>	

5.	Glenhurst West RT	137 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30-259	CWA
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Visibility context photos submitted at the table.				
Representing	<b>Chip Webster</b> , Chip Webster Architecture – Reviewed changes per previous concerns. Ethan Griffin, Chip Webster Architecture <b>Steven Cohen</b> , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP – Due to the conservation land and restrictions, the trees can't be cut down and will help mitigate visibility.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:47) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from September 17. <b>Barham</b> – North elevation scale of doors and windows in the center block is still too great and should be further reduced. Chimney tops look blocky and should be treated more traditionally. North elevation flanking gables with four-ganged window/door combinations should be reduced. Assemblage of all the parts is not persuasive as typical for Nantucket; should be either more rigidly formal or more distinctively additive. Massing on this is not convincingly additive. Do appreciate is that it isn't being built on an acropolis. Hipped entry is not appropriate for Nantucket. Roof slopes, of the links and the gables either side of them, is less than 7 pitch. The flush dormers on the projecting wings are too large and the ganged windows don't work. The links containing the staircases, the ganged windows are inappropriate. Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate. <b>Hill-Holdgate</b> – Compared this to the abutting structure and what made that appropriate. The center block reads as a 5-bay but the fenestration doesn't work; second floor should be double hung and doors on first floor should be intermixed with windows. The style is too modern for Nantucket. The roof walk might get away with a skirt but should be natural to weather to blend with the roof and the skirt boards should have gaps. Agree with Mr. Barham. <b>Coombs</b> – The ganged windows on the east and west elevations will be visible and should be eliminated. Agree with Mr. Barham & Ms Hill-Holdgate. <b>McLaughlin</b> – Agree with what's been said. All four elevations are visible from a traveled way; the second floor is highly visible. The structure design is completely inappropriate and doesn't fit with the neighborhood. It is over fenestrated and has too many ganged windows. <b>Williams</b> – Nothing to add.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>		
6.	Desert Island LLC	11 Delaney Road (Lot 4)	New dwelling	30-66	Thornewill Design
Sitting	Barham (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates					
Recused	Williams, Hill-Holdgate				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Luke Thornewill</b> , Thornewill Design –Reviewed changes made since the last hearing. <b>Jeff Kaschuluk</b> – The house is up against the 50-foot buffer for wetlands so can't move back.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(2:13) <b>Camp</b> – No comments; it is a nice design and appropriate. Agree the front portico could be scaled down. <b>McLaughlin</b> – Agree. <b>Barham</b> – The front porch feels too wide for the door it covers; the combination of door and sidelights is too much for a 3-bay structure. Parking is too wide in front of the house. Because the house is so close to the street, shutters might enliven its presentation or remove the porch and use a more elaborate door surround. Eaves feel too high and dormers look to be swallowed by the roof.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with the front porch width scaled down 15 inches each side of the front door. (Camp)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>60438</b>	

7.	Desert Island LLC	15 Delaney Road	New dwelling	30-66	Thornewill Design
Sitting	Barham (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Williams, Hill-Holdgate				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Luke Thornewill</b> , Thornewill Design –Reviewed changes made since the last hearing. The lot has the same wetland confines as 11 Delaney Road.				
Public	Jeff Kaschuluk				
Concerns	None (2:24) <b>Camp</b> – No comments. <b>McLaughlin</b> – It is a harmonious design. <b>Barham</b> – The sidelights should not go to the floor, the glass should not go below the door handle.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with a solid panel on the sidelights to the height of the door knob. (Camp)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate # 60439</b>		
2.	Brodie, Peter	70 Sankaty Road – SAB	Addition, alterations	49-81	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Val Oliver</b> – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(2:29) There is a drawing error; other than that, the application is approvable.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with corrected drawings. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate # 60440</b>		
3.	Dunning, John	5 North Liberty Street – HSAB	Move/addition	42.3.4-7	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Matt MacEachern</b> , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Jamie Feeley, Cottage and Castle Construction				
Public	None				
Concerns	(2:33) <b>Staff</b> – Read previous concerns from September 26. <b>Hill-Holdgate</b> – The barn doors need to remain Cottage red. South elevation, triple window dormer is too large; should be scaled back to what was originally there; there should be no dormer on the addition. North elevation, original submission was more successful; bringing the eave up is not appropriate; dormers are too large; “B” windows in the gable should be smaller. West elevation “B” windows are again too large. East elevation on the side closer to the road, the dormer windows should be smaller. <b>McLaughlin</b> – An awning window faces the road; should be fixed or a hopper. <b>Williams</b> – South elevation has a drawing error. Concerned about the size of the “A” windows in the basement access.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions and color samples. (Hill-Holdgate)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate #</b>		
8.	Desert Island LLC	64 Cliff Lt 5 (13 Delaney)	Partial demo/addition	30-66	Kaschuluk
Sitting	Barham (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Williams, Hill-Holdgate				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	<b>Jeff Kaschuluk</b> – Presented the project. Reviewed the changes elevation by elevation.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(2:49) <b>Camp</b> – Southeast elevation, the pitch seems shallow. <b>McLaughlin</b> – No comment. <b>Barham</b> – The fan-top door is a distinguishing period feature of this house and should be reused.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff preserving the fan over the front door. (Camp)</b>				
Vote	Carried unanimously		<b>Certificate # 60441</b>		

Quorum lost.

Rest of agenda held for the beginning of October 22 meeting.

9. Newman	One Perry Ln/Bartlett Rd	New dwelling	67-901/902	P. Kyberg
10. 26 Pleasant	26 Pleasant Street – HSAB	Addition	55.4.1-3	BPC
11. Hughes, Tom	107 Squam Road	Garage rev/elec. panel	12-60	Gina
12. Glowacki, Walter	6 Lovers Lane	Hardscaping: fence	68-201	Nikki
13. Glowacki, Walter	8 Lovers Lane	Hardscaping: fence	68-200	Nikki
4. Bazinet, Jason	15 Burnell Street – SAB	Revisions: house	73.4.2-48.1	D. Wiley
5. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Revisions: house	80-196	BPC
6. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Revisions: garage	80-196	BPC
7. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Revisions: cabana	80-196	BPC
8. Knutson	9 Dunham Street	Revisions: pool	80-196	BPC
9. Vogel	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Guest house	73-113	Emeritus
10. Vogel	22 Blackfish Lane – SAB	Hardscaping: pool	73-113	Emeritus
14. Shuttleworth, Paul	112 Somerset Road	Revisions: new dwelling	66-223	BPC

VI. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes -	September 24 <sup>th</sup> , 26 <sup>th</sup> and October 1 <sup>st</sup> , and 3 <sup>rd</sup>
Review Minutes -	None
Other Business -	Organizational meeting October 29 <sup>th</sup> and discussion of 2013 schedule Scheduling of Cienava/Head of Plains hearing 74 Centre St hardscaping
Commission Comments	

Motion to Adjourn: 3:11 p.m.

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board    SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board  
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board    MAB – Madaket Advisory Board